Tab 1: Contact Information

Name of main applicant:	City of Toledo, Department of Public Service
Address of the main applicant:	110 North Westwood Toledo, Ohio 43607
Telephone Number:	419-245-1003
Facsimile Number:	419-936-7299
E-Mail Address:	troy.dowling@toledo.oh.gov
Applicant contact information:	Troy Dowling Administrator
County:	Lucas
Population data:	287,208 (Toledo, Ohio)

Tab 2: Collaborative Partner

Name of collaborative partner:	The University of Toledo
Address:	2801 West Bancroft Street Plan Operations Building C/O Charles Lehnert Room 1120 Toledo, Ohio 43606
Telephone Number:	419-530-1448
Facsimile Number:	419-530-1401
E-Mail Address:	charles.lehnert@utoledo.edu
Population data:	287,208 (Toledo, Ohio)
Nature of Partnership:	Coproduction

The City of Toledo and University of Toledo are committed to supporting the quality of life in Northwest Ohio and the generation of new economic opportunities through the implementation of new "green" environmental initiatives, the exploration of collaborative opportunities to advance the region's environmental sustainability and good stewardship of their respective facilities and operations.

The establishment of a Regional Composting Facility would improve the environmental sustainability of the region and:

- Increase the viability of regional landfills by eliminating a waste stream that could be recycled and productively reused.
- Yield financial savings to the City of Toledo and potentially other jurisdictions in the region.
- Provide an opportunity to support research on new scientific methods of composting organic material and its uses.
- Provide new business opportunities for companies able to utilize the composted materials for production processes and new products.
- Create a regionally beneficial model for collaboration on environmental sustainability projects.

The University of Toledo brings a strong commitment and exceptional expertise to the collaboration. Two of the University's seven Areas of Research Excellence relate to the environment:

- Energy Sustainability and Conservation
- Environmental Impacts on Health

The University of Toledo has gained an international reputation as a leading institution for alternative energy research. Additionally, the University is working to establish a new School for Green Chemistry and Engineering to build on its existing expertise in alternative energy and sustainability.

The City of Toledo is the central urban city in Lucas County, which has a population of more than 440,000 people. The City's Department of Public Service has a staff with broad expertise in engineering, environmental issues and compliance, sustainability, and the administration of public services including waste disposal and recycling.

With the City of Toledo as the lead submitting agency, the City and the University of Toledo mutually agree under a Memorandum of Understanding to collaborate on the submission of a grant application in the amount of $100,000 to the State of Ohio Department of Development for a feasibility study for a Regional Composting Facility.

Tab 3: Project Information

Project name: Regional Composting Facility

Brief Project Description:

Currently, the City of Toledo does not have a composting facility of this nature. Such a facility would help in protecting, conserving, and enhancing environmental resources and yield savings to the City of Toledo through reduced operating costs while providing healthy work and living environments.

The City of Toledo and University of Toledo are committed to supporting the quality of life in Northwest Ohio and the generation of new economic opportunities through the implementation of new "green" environmental initiatives, the exploration of collaborative opportunities to advance the region's environmental sustainability and good stewardship of their respective facilities and operations.

The establishment of a Regional Composting Facility would improve the environmental sustainability of the region and:

- Increase the viability of regional landfills by eliminating a waste stream that could be recycled and productively reused.
- Yield financial savings to the City of Toledo and potentially other jurisdictions in the region.
- Provide an opportunity to support research on new scientific methods of composting organic material and its uses.
- Provide new business opportunities for companies able to utilize the composted materials for production processes and new products.
- Create a regionally beneficial model for collaboration on environmental sustainability projects.

The University of Toledo brings a strong commitment and exceptional expertise to the collaboration. Two of the University's seven Areas of Research Excellence relate to the environment:

- Energy Sustainability and Conservation
- Environmental Impacts on Health

The University of Toledo has gained an international reputation as a leading institution for alternative energy research. Additionally, the University is working to establish a new School for Green Chemistry and Engineering to build on its existing expertise in alternative energy and sustainability.

The City of Toledo is the central urban city in Lucas County, which has a population of more than 440,000 people. The City's Department of Public Service has a staff with broad expertise in engineering, environmental issues and compliance, sustainability, and the administration of public services including waste disposal and recycling.

With the City of Toledo as the lead submitting agency, the City and the University of Toledo mutually agree under a Memorandum of Understanding to collaborate on the submission of a grant application in the amount of $100,000 to the State of Ohio Department of Development for a feasibility study for a Regional Composting Facility.

Historically, the City of Toledo has given approximately $250,000 per year in taxpayer proceeds to a vendor for leaf disposal purposes. At this time, we already have seventeen ideal acres readily available on City of Toledo-owned property for this project. Should successfully developing and operating a regional composting facility at the City of Toledo be feasible, then other parties will likely

be encouraged by – and further enhance – our momentum. This will foster future partnerships. Such entities could include:

- Area municipalities
- Toledo-Lucas County Port Authority
- Keep Toledo-Lucas County Beautiful
- Metroparks of the Toledo Area
- Lucas County Solid Waste Management District
- City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities

The applicant, City of Toledo's Department of Public Service, is composed of five Divisions:

1. Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor
2. Division of Solid Waste
3. Division of Transportation
4. Division of Parks, Recreation & Forestry
5. Division of Facility & Fleet Operations

A well-operating regional composting facility could:

- Receive leaves and demolition-related concrete and brick from the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor
- Receive leaves, brush & grass from partners
- Supply the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor with soil for demolition sites
- Provide organics to the Division of Solid Waste to create energy to help power the Department of Public Utilities' Division of Water Reclamation
- Allow cost-effective road expansions at the landfill operated by the Division of Solid Waste through concrete and brick recycling to help strategically place refuse, which is then covered per Ohio EPA specifications
- Supply the Division of Parks, Recreation & Forestry with baseball diamond dust through concrete and brick recycling
- Create suitable stone materials for the City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities

Type of Award Applicant is Seeking: Feasibility Study

Problem Statement:

Currently, the City of Toledo does not have a composting facility of this nature. Such a facility would help in protecting, conserving, and enhancing environmental resources and yield savings to the City of Toledo through reduced operating costs while providing healthy work and living environments.

Targeted Approach to Innovation: Coproduction

Anticipated Return on Investment:

As detailed on page 4-2, the submitted financial documentation reflects an anticipated ROI of 109.13%.

Probability of the Proposal's Success:

The City of Toledo's Department of Public Service and the University of Toledo are committed to continuous improvement through such measures as benchmarking. Through numerous meetings, we

see an excellent opportunity for anticipated savings of taxpayer dollars year after year. The associated feasibility study will guide us in additional planning of the project implementation.

Sylvania, Ohio has a composting facility. This project is both scalable and replicable.

Applicant's Plans and Ability to Replicate and/or Scale the Proposal to Allow for the Inclusion of other Political Subdivisions:

With the facility in place, other entities – including, but not limited to, the following – may easily contribute directly to and benefit directly from this beneficial operation:

- Area municipalities
- Toledo-Lucas County Port Authority
- Keep Toledo-Lucas County Beautiful
- Metroparks of the Toledo Area
- Lucas County Solid Waste Management District
- City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities

Identification of Whether the Proposed Project is Part of a Larger Consolidation Effort:

This project is promising in its ability to expand and remain successful with additional collaborative partners.

With the facility in place, other entities – including, but not limited to, the following – may easily contribute directly to and benefit directly from this beneficial operation:

- Area municipalities
- Toledo-Lucas County Port Authority
- Keep Toledo-Lucas County Beautiful
- Metroparks of the Toledo Area
- Lucas County Solid Waste Management District
- City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities

A well-operating regional composting facility could:

- Receive leaves and demolition-related concrete and brick from the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor
- Receive leaves, brush & grass from partners
- Supply the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor with soil for demolition sites
- Provide organics to the Division of Solid Waste to create energy to help power the Department of Public Utilities' Division of Water Reclamation
- Allow cost-effective road expansions at the landfill operated by the Division of Solid Waste through concrete and brick recycling to help strategically place refuse, which is then covered per Ohio EPA specifications
- Supply the Division of Parks, Recreation & Forestry with baseball diamond dust through concrete and brick recycling
- Create suitable stone materials for the City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities

Identification of Past Success on an Innovation Project:

The City of Toledo's Department of Public Service has a well-documented history of recent successes including, but not limited to, the following:

- Successfully working with well-respected consultant Dr. Steven Cady on "Benchmark in Best Practices" to identify short-term, intermediate-term and long term initiatives (classified as either Efficiency, Shared Service, Coproduction or Shared Merger) to better the five Divisions to the Department of Public Service and the City of Toledo
- Achieved strong partnerships with Sister Divisions and Departments (cross-Divisional and cross-Departmental) for such operations as leaf collection and snow/ice control (Shared Service)
- Partnered with Sister Divisions and Departments for targeted neighborhood cleanups (Shared Service)
- The Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor is currently captaining the efforts to achieve an FCC mandate well ahead of schedule. The FCC has issued a two-phase radio frequency Narrowbanding initiative that the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor will accomplish with only one phase while partnering with the other City of Toledo Department of Public Service Divisions that are also affected by this mandate. Additionally, the Division has also engaged impacted Divisions within the City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities. (Shared Service)
- The Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor effectively collaborated with the Division of Facility & Fleet Operations to create a vehicle & equipment replacement plan. One chief goal was to reduce true cost per mile amounts. (Coproduction)
- We have also accomplished key components to our Better Buildings initiative, which was created by the U.S. Department of Energy. We have realized lighting-related savings in excess of 30% through utilizing new technologies. Also, applicable HVAC improvements have been installed. (Efficiency)
- The Division of Solid Waste at the City of Toledo's Department of Public Service recently privatized its refuse collection operations to save taxpayer dollars. (Efficiency)

How the Proposed Project is Responding to Current Substantial Changes in Economic Demand for Local or Regional Government Services:

As is a common theme amongst both Public and Private Sectors, we must do more with less. The City of Toledo has experienced decreasing populations and fluctuating unemployment rates. We are presenting an opportunity to internalize the creation of materials that are currently purchased through outside vendors with taxpayer dollars. We anticipate significant savings through this proposed internalization.

Intent to Implement Recommendations of a Performance or any Other Audit Recommendation:

Through our "Benchmarking in Best Practices" process at the Department of Public Service, we have discovered that the City of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania has a fascinating composting program. Under Section 4 (Significant Measures) of the Local Government Innovation Fund Project Selection Methodology, this fits the criteria of "informed by benchmarking" under the sub-section for Performance Audit Implementation/Cost Benchmarking. Some details of composting operations are located at: http://www.pittsburghpa.gov/green/reducereuserecycle.htm and also on pages 5-6 through 5-8.

How the Project Facilitates an Improved Business Environment and/or Promotes Community Attraction:

This project promotes community attraction in the following ways:

- Fosters future collaborative partnerships with such entities as:
  - Area municipalities
  - Toledo-Lucas County Port Authority
  - Keep Toledo-Lucas County Beautiful
  - Metroparks of the Toledo Area
  - Lucas County Solid Waste Management District
  - City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities
- Receive leaves and demolition-related concrete and brick from the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor
- Receive leaves, brush & grass from partners
- Supply the Division of Streets, Bridges & Harbor with soil for demolition sites
- Provide organics to the Division of Solid Waste to create energy to help power the Department of Public Utilities' Division of Water Reclamation
- Allow cost-effective road expansions at the landfill operated by the Division of Solid Waste through concrete and brick recycling to help strategically place refuse, which is then covered per Ohio EPA specifications
- Supply the Division of Parks, Recreation & Forestry with baseball diamond dust through concrete and brick recycling
- Create suitable stone materials for the City of Toledo Department of Public Utilities
- Increase the viability of regional landfills by eliminating a waste stream that could be recycled and productively reused.
- Yield financial savings to the City of Toledo and potentially other jurisdictions in the region.
- Provide an opportunity to support research on new scientific methods of composting organic material and its uses.
- Provide new business opportunities for companies able to utilize the composted materials for production processes and new products.
- Create a regionally beneficial model for collaboration on environmental sustainability projects.
- Additionally, the University is working to establish a new School for Green Chemistry and Engineering to build on its existing expertise in alternative energy and sustainability.

Tab 4: Financial Documentation

Based upon a conversation with the State of Ohio Department of Development, the most recent three years of financial history cannot be provided due to the design of this proposed project. Historically, the City of Toledo has given approximately $250,000 per year in taxpayer proceeds to a vendor for leaf disposal purposes. What is provided on the next page is the remainder of the required financial documentation.

Annual Return		
Landfill Road Expansion	$ 20,000.00	
Topsoil (Non-Demolition Purposes)	$ 40,000.00	
Topsoil (Demolition Purposes)	$ 337,776.00	*
Savings from Hauling Leaves In-House	$ 250,000.00	
Total	**$ 647,776.00**	

Annual Investment		
Labor	$ 186,900.48	**
Fuel	$ 150,000.00	
Equipment	$ 186,698.15	***
Repairs/Maintenance	$ 70,000.00	
Total	**$ 593,598.63**	

Anticipated Return on Investment 109.13%

To provide conservative anticipated figures, the following items were excluded from annual savings:
1. stone for the Department of Public Utilities
2. energy provided to Water Reclamation
3. baseball diamond dust for Parks, Recreation & Forestry

* 3" of soil on 400 demolition sites with an average area of 40' by 120' at the rate of $844.44 per demolished unit

** One General Foreman working 2080 hours at an hourly rate of $24.878 with annual fringes of $24,974.91, one Heavy Equipment Operator working 2080 hours at an hourly rate of $18.113 with annual fringes of $20,573.16 and one Utility Worker working 2080 hours at an hourly rate of $15.731 with annual fringes of $19,210.65

*** One tub grinder for $372,550 with a useful life of at least six years, one turner for $259,856 with a useful life of at least five years, one compost screener for $ 188,470 with a useful life of at least ten years, one watering truck for $162,666 with a useful life of at least nine years and one stone/concrete crusher for $250,000 with a useful life of at least seven years

We are requesting $100,000 as a grant toward a feasibility study.

To show our level of commitment, we can and will provide a 70% match.

The projections are detailed under "Annual Return" and "Annual Investment". Our anticipated savings over three years is $162,532.11.

Tab 5: Supporting Documentation

5-2: Memorandum of Understanding between the University of Toledo and the City of Toledo

5-4: Resolution of Support from Applicant's Governing Entity

5-6: Benchmarking Material from Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

5-9: Documentation from the 2010 U.S. Census for the City of Toledo

5-10: Self-Score Assessment

Memorandum of Understanding
Between
The University of Toledo
And
The City of Toledo
Regarding a Feasibility Study for a Regional Composting Facility

This Memorandum of Understanding made this 27th day of February, 2012, between The University of Toledo and the City of Toledo expresses the intent of the parties to collaborate on a Feasibility Study for a Regional Composting Facility.

The City of Toledo and The University of Toledo are committed to supporting the quality of life in Northwest Ohio and the generation of new economic opportunities through the implementation of new "green" environmental initiatives, the exploration of collaborative opportunities to advance the region's environmental sustainability and good stewardship of their respective facilities and operations.

Benefits of a Regional Composting Facility:

The establishment of a Regional Composting Facility would improve the environmental sustainability of the region and:

- Increase the viability of regional landfills by eliminating a waste stream that could be recycled and productively reused.
- Yield financial savings to the City of Toledo and potentially other jurisdictions in the region.
- Provide an opportunity to support research on new scientific methods of composting organic material and its uses.
- Provide new business opportunities for companies able to utilize the composted materials for production processes and new products.
- Create a regionally beneficial model for collaboration on environmental sustainability projects.

City of Toledo and The University of Toledo Collaboration

The University of Toledo brings a strong commitment and exceptional expertise to the collaboration. Two of the University's seven Areas of Research Excellence relate to the environment:

- Energy Sustainability and Conservation
- Environmental Impacts on Health

The University of Toledo has gained an international reputation as a leading institution for alternative energy research. Additionally the University is working to establish a new School for Green Chemistry and Engineering to build on its existing expertise in alternative energy and sustainability.

The City of Toledo is the central urban city in Lucas County, which has a population of more than 440,000 people. The City's Department of Public Services has a staff with broad expertise in engineering, environmental issues and compliance, sustainability, and the administration of public services including waste disposal and recycling.

With the City of Toledo as the lead submitting agency, the City and The University of Toledo mutually agree under this Memorandum of Understanding to collaborate on the submission of a grant application in an amount not to exceed $100,000 to the State of Ohio Local Government Innovation Fund for a Feasibility Study for a Regional Composting Facility and if successful cooperate in completing the Study.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, this Memorandum of Understanding is executed by the parties the day and year first above written.

City of Toledo

By: _____ 2/28/12
Michael P. Bell, Mayor

The University of Toledo

By: _____
Charles Lehnert, Vice President of Administration

Approved as to content:

_____
Department of Public Services

Approved:

_____

Approved as to form:

_____ 2/28/12
Department of Law

DPS 022812 LGIF APPLICATION RESOLUTION
Department of Public Service
Ed Moore (x1835)
(Revised)

RES. 91-12

Resolution authorizing and expressing Toledo City Council support for the Department of Public Service submitting application materials to the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program for the purpose of obtaining financial assistance for the creation of a Regional Composting Facility; and declaring an emergency.

SUMMARY & BACKGROUND:

The State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program administers and has available a competitive grant to financially assist municipalities. The City of Toledo is submitting a Local Government Innovation Fund grant application requesting an amount not to exceed $100,000 for completing a feasibility study for a composting facility. Such a facility would help in protecting, conserving, and enhancing environmental resources and yield savings to the City of Toledo through reduced operating costs while providing healthy work and living environments.

This resolution permits the Department of Public Service to prepare and submit application materials for funding to assist in that process. NOW, THEREFORE,

Be it resolved by the Council of the City of Toledo:

SECTION 1. That the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program administers and has available a competitive grant to financially assist municipalities and that the City of Toledo, Department of Public Service desires to obtain financial assistance from said program.

SECTION 2. That the Mayor of the City of Toledo is authorized to prepare and file application materials to the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program for financial assistance and to provide all information and documentation required to become eligible to access such possible funding assistance.

SECTION 3. That if the city is awarded funding, and subject to availability, appropriation and authorizations, the City of Toledo agrees to obligate the funds required to satisfactorily complete the proposed project; which funding will become eligible for reimbursement under the terms and conditions of the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program.

SECTION 4. That this Resolution is declared to be an emergency measure and shall be in force and effect immediately from and after its passage. The reason for the

emergency lies in the fact that the same is necessary for the immediate preservation of the public peace, health, safety, and property and for the further reason that this Resolution must be immediately effective in order to permit the timely submittal of the aforementioned application materials for funding for this important project as soon as possible.

Vote on emergency clause: yeas _12__, nays __0__.

Adopted: February 28, 2012, as an emergency measure: yeas _12_, nays __0__.

PITTSBURGH
A MOST LIVABLE CITY

What is the City doing, and what can you do?

Waste Reduction

Under Mayor Ravenstahl's direction, the City has begun to look into ways to not only recycle, but to create less waste in the first place. Employees are encouraged to use durable items on the job, such as reusable coffee mugs and water bottles, instead of disposables. New printers in City offices have the capability to print double-sided.

Using electronic communication and record keeping can also eliminate paper waste. A new web-based permitting software will be implemented in fall 2010 to eliminate the printing and copying of more than 160,000 permits and licenses each year. In addition to the environmental benefits, there is an estimated savings of $400,000.

Recycling

Curbside Recycling

The City also operates a successful recycling program that oversees curbside pick-up, several drop-off locations, special events recycling, and recycling in City-owned facilities. Through "single stream recycling," residents can place all recyclables in the same blue bag at curbside for pick-up. The City provides collection of

plastic (#1-5), glass and metal containers, newspapers, magazines, catalogs, paperboard (e.g. cereal boxes, milk cartons), office paper, mixed paper, phonebooks, junk mail, hardback books, and corrugated cardboard. Rinse all containers. Everything but cardboard can be placed in the same blue plastic bag at the curb for pick-up. Corrugated cardboard needs to be flattened in lengths not exceeding 5 ft. and tied. For more information and the schedule for pick-up in your neighborhood, please see collection schedules on the Department of Public Works website.

With single stream recycling, there is no need to separate items by type, which makes it easier for residents to recycle. In fact, following the change to single stream, recycling rates increased over 30% by tonnage.

Drop-Offs

The City operates five drop-off recycling locations that are free to City residents. Hours of Operation, Location, and Contact Information can be found on the Department of Public Works website.

Composting

The City provides composting for leaves and other yard waste to residents. Environmental Service crews pick up leaves curbside at least once in the fall and also pick up Christmas trees in January each year. Residents can also take yard waste to one of the participating DPW drop-off sites. Yard debris, including leaves, grass, plants, tree trimmings, branches, and shrubs are accepted at the East End, Hazelwood, and West End drop-off locations. These sites cannot accept food waste. Yard debris should either be loose or in paper bags; plastic bags will not be accepted. Stones, dirt, rocks, manure, garbage, lumber, and food waste, will NOT be accepted. Proof of residency required. There is no charge for cars and SUVs, but a small fee is applied for trucks and vehicles with trailers. Please call 412-255-2773 for details and the hours of collection for each drop-off location.

> Residents often question why the yard waste is hauled out of the city to be composted by a third-party contractor, instead of being composted on a vacant lot or in a park. Because of the large quantity of yard waste to be composted, the City must use a facility permitted by the state DEP. Using a third-party contractor ensures environmental protection, stormwater control, odor management, and rodent and pest control.

Please note - While the City does pick up leaves from streets when they are creating a safety hazard, residents are not permitted to rake leaves into the streets. Please call 412-488-7940 for specific details on the removal of leaves and yard waste.

What can you do?

Addressing the amount of waste that you personally produce is one of the cheapest and easiest ways to reduce your environmental impact. Following the Reduce, Reuse, Recycle (3Rs) mantra is the recommended way.

Reducing the amount of waste you produce is the most effective way to make a difference. After all, when you don't produce waste in the first place, you don't have to worry about throwing it away or recycling it later. Simple habit changes are key.

Waste reduction examples

Reuse is also a very easy and effective way to make an environmental difference in your every day life. The concept is pretty simple. The more products can be reused, the less of them that need to be made and the less

that end up in a landfill. This avoids the energy use and pollution across the entire life cycle of the new products that you avoid consuming. There are many simple things that you can do to reuse items in your life.

Reuse examples

Composting

As explained above, residents of Pittsburgh can compost yard waste through Department of Public Works drop-off locations. However, these sites cannot accept food waste. Backyard composting is a practical way to reduce the amount of garbage you send to the landfill while creating a nutrient rich product that can fertilize your garden or yard.

Examples of things that can be composted in your own yard include leaves, grass clippings, fruit and vegetable waste, eggshells, coffee grounds and filters, and tea bags. Items that should not be composted include meat and dairy products, pet wastes, and grease or oil.

For assistance getting started with composting, visit our "Community Connections" page. (Link to composting resources)

Hard to Recycle Items

There are many items and materials that are considered hard to recycle or properly dispose of, including electronic waste (televisions, cell phones, computers), batteries, Freon appliances, compact fluorescent light bulbs, printer cartridges, and paint. Although hard to recycle, it is most important to recycle these items because of the heavy metals and other toxic substances contained in them that can otherwise end up our air and groundwater.

There are also many special collection events and collection sites for these materials run by the City of Pittsburgh, local non-profits, and businesses. The organizations below can provide more information on hard to recycle collection opportunities.

- Pennsylvania Resources Council
- Southwestern Pennsylvania Household Hazardous Waste Task Force
- Construction Junction
- Earth 911

© 2012 | CITY OF PITTSBURGH | LUKE RAVENSTAHL, MAYOR

This page was last modified August 26, 2011 at 3:22 pm.

State & County QuickFacts

Toledo (city), Ohio

People QuickFacts	Toledo	Ohio
Population, 2011 estimate	NA	11,544,951
Population, 2010	287,208	11,536,504
Population, percent change, 2000 to 2010	-8.4%	1.6%
Population, 2000	313,619	11,353,140
Persons under 5 years, percent, 2010	7.4%	6.2%
Persons under 18 years, percent, 2010	24.0%	23.7%
Persons 65 years and over, percent, 2010	12.1%	14.1%
Female persons, percent, 2010	51.6%	51.2%
White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	64.8%	82.7%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	27.2%	12.2%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.4%	0.2%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.1%	1.7%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z	0.0%
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	3.9%	2.1%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	7.4%	3.1%
White persons not Hispanic, percent, 2010	61.4%	81.1%
Living in same house 1 year & over, 2006-2010	80.9%	85.0%
Foreign born persons, percent, 2006-2010	3.5%	3.8%
Language other than English spoken at home, pct age 5+, 2006-2010	6.5%	6.3%
High school graduates, percent of persons age 25+, 2006-2010	84.5%	87.4%
Bachelor's degree or higher, pct of persons age 25+, 2006-2010	17.6%	24.1%
Mean travel time to work (minutes), workers age 16+, 2006 -2010	19.2	22.7
Housing units, 2010	138,039	5,127,508
Homeownership rate, 2006-2010	58.0%	69.2%
Housing units in multi-unit structures, percent, 2006-2010	30.6%	23.0%
Median value of owner-occupied housing units, 2006-2010	$96,500	$136,400
Households, 2006-2010	120,406	4,552,270
Persons per household, 2006-2010	2.37	2.46
Per capita money income in past 12 months (2010 dollars) 2006-2010	$18,758	$25,113
Median household income 2006-2010	$34,260	$47,358
Persons below poverty level, percent, 2006-2010	23.8%	14.2%

Local Government Innovation Fund Project Selection Methodology
Self-Score Assessment

Section 1: Financing Measures

Financing Measures	Criteria	Points
Financial Information	Applicant provides thorough, detailed and complete information	5
Local Match	70% or greater	5
	Subtotal	**10**

Section 2: Collaborative Measures

Collaborative Measures	Criteria	Points
Population	Applicant (or collaborative partner) is not a county but has a population 20,001 or greater.	3
Participating Entities	More than one applicant	5
	Subtotal	**8**

Section 3: Success Measures

Success Measures	Criteria	Points
Expected Return	75% or greater	30
Past Success	Yes	5
Scalable/Replicable Proposal	The project is both scalable and replicable	10
Probability of Success	Provided	5
	Subtotal	**50**

Section 4: Significance Measures

Significance Measures	Criteria	Points
Performance Audit Implementation/Cost Benchmarking	Project implements a recommendation from an audit or is informed by benchmarking	5
Economic Impact	Applicant clearly demonstrates economic impact	5
Response to Economic Demand	Yes	5
	Subtotal	**15**

Section 5: Council Measures

Council Measures	Criteria	Points
Council Preference	The applicant demonstrates innovation or inventiveness with the project	10
	Subtotal	**10**

TOTAL POINTS 93

Ohio | Department of Development

John R. Kasich, Governor Christiane Schmenk, Director

April 2, 2012

Troy Dowling
City of Toledo, Department of Public Services
110 North Westwood
Toledo, Ohio 43607

RE: Application Cure Letter

Dear Troy Dowling:

The Ohio Department of Development (Development) has received and is currently reviewing your application for Round 1 of Local Government Innovation Fund program. During this review Development has determined that additional information is needed for your application. The identified item(s) requiring your attention are listed on the attached page(s). Please respond only to the issues raised. Failure to fully address all the identified items could lead to a competitive score reduction or ineligibility for Round 1 of the Local Government Innovation Fund program. **A written response from the applicant to this completeness review is due to Development no later than 5:00 p.m. on *April 30, 2012*.** Please send the response in a single email to lgif@development.ohio.gov and include "Cure—Project Name" in the subject line.

While this cure letter represents the additional information needed for Development review, the Local Government Innovation Council continues to reserve the right to request additional information about your application.

Thank you once again for your participation in Local Government Innovation program. Please contact the Office of Redevelopment at lgif@development.ohio.gov or 614-995-2292 if you have further questions regarding your application or the information requested in this letter.

Sincerely,

Thea J. Walsh

Thea J. Walsh, AICP
Deputy Chief, Office of Redevelopment
Ohio Department of Development

77 South High Street
P.O. Box 1001
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1001 U.S.A.

614 | 466 2480
800 | 848 1300
www.development.ohio.gov

The State of Ohio is an Equal Opportunity Employer and Provider of ADA Services

Local Government Innovation Fund Completeness Review

Applicant: City of Toledo

Project Name: Regional Composting Facility

Request Type: Grant

Issues for Response

1. Match

A minimum of 10% match is required for all projects. Matching funds must be 10% of the **total project cost** (not 10% of the funding request). Please document your 10% match and provide evidence of the contribution.

For **in-kind contributions**, please provide documentation as outlined in section 2.06 of the Local Government Innovation Fund program policies. Certification of in-kind contributions may only be made for past investments. Anticipated in-kind contributions must be certified **after** the contribution is made

2. Budget

Please provide a line item budget that includes at minimum: 1) the sources of all funds being contributed to the project include **all** sources—cash, in-kind, etc.; 2) the uses of all funds (provide a line item for each use); 3) the total project costs (including the funding request **and** the local match. Please be sure that all uses of funds are eligible expenses as set forth in the program guidelines.

Example:

Collaboration Village's Project Budget

Sources of Funds

LGIF Request	$100,000
Match Contribution (10%)	$ 11,111
Total	$111,111

Uses of Funds

Consultant Fees for Study	$111,111
Total	$111,111

Total Project Cost: $111,111

3. Self-Score Assessment

Please complete the interactive selection methodology available on the LGIF program website http://www.development.ohio.gov/Urban/LGIF.htm (select selection methodology) to score your project. Applicants do not need to complete the Council Preference or score validation sections when scoring their projects.

4. Resolutions of Support

Resolutions of support must be provided by the governing body of the main applicant and each collaborative partner. If the collaborative partner is a private entity with no governing body, a letter of support **for the project** is required.

Cure – Regional Composting Facility

Name of Main Applicant: City of Toledo, Department of Public Service
Project Name: Regional Composting Facility
Request Type: Grant

Issue #1: Match

The 41.18% match for this project comes in the form of a $70,000 direct local match.

Issue #2: Budget

Regional Composting Facility Feasibility Study Project

Sources of Funds

ODOD LGIF Request	$100,000
Direct Local Match (41.18%)	$70,000
Project Total	$170,000

Uses of Funds

Consulting Fees for Feasibility Study	$170,000
Project Total	$170,000

Total Project Cost: $170,000

Issue #3: Self-Score Assessment

Please refer to the following four (4) pages.

Local Government Innovation Fund Program

Application Scoring

Lead Applicant	City of Toledo, Department of Public Service
Project Name	Regional Composting Facility

☑	**Grant Application**

or

☐	**Loan Application**

The Local Government Innovation Fund Council
77 South High Street
P.O. Box 1001
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1001
(614) 995-2292

Local Government Innovation Fund Project Scoring Sheet

Section 1: Financing Measures

Financing Measures	Description	Criteria	Max Points	Applicant Self Score	Validated Score
Financial Information	*Applicant includes financial information (i.e., service related operating budgets) for the most recent three years and the three year period following the project. The financial information must be directly related to the scope of the project and will be used as the cost basis for determining any savings resulting from the project.*	Applicant provides a thorough, detailed and complete financial information	**5**	◉	
		Applicant provided more than minimum requirements but did not provide additional justification or support	**3**	○	
		Applicant provided minimal financial information	**1**	○	
			Points	5	0
Repayment Structure (Loan Only)	*Applicant demonstrates a viable repayment source to support loan award. Secondary source can be in the form of a debt reserve, bank participation, a guarantee from a local entity, or other collateral (i.e.,emergency rainy day , or contingency fund, etc.).*	Applicant clearly demonstrates a secondary repayment source.	**5**	○	
		Applicant does not have a secondary repayment source.	**0**	○	
			Points	0	0
Local Match	*Percentage of local matching funds being contributed to the project. This may include in-kind contributions.*	70% or greater	**5**	○	
		40-69.99%	**3**	◉	
		10-39.99%	**1**	○	
			Points	3	0
			Total Section Points	8	0

Section 2: Collaborative Measures

Collaborative Measures	Description	Criteria	Max Points	Applicant Self Score	Validated Score
Population	*Applicant's population (or the population of the area(s) served) falls within one of the listed categories as determined by the U.S. Census Bureau. Population scoring will be determined by the **smallest** population listed in the application. Applications from (or collaborating with) small communities are preferred.*	Applicant (or collaborative partner) is not a county and has a population of less than 20,000 residents	**5**	○	
		Applicant (or collaborative partner) is a county but has less than 235,000	**5**	○	
		Applicant (or collaborative partner) is not a county but has a population 20,001 or greater.	**3**	◉	
		Applicant (or collaborative partner) is a county with a population of 235,001 residents or more	**3**	○	
			Points	3	0
Participating Entities	*Applicant has executed partnership agreements outlining all collaborative partners and participation agreements and has resolutions of support. (Note: Sole applicants only need to provide a resolution of support from its governing entity.)*	More than one applicant	**5**	◉	
		Single applicant	**1**	○	
			Points	5	0
			Total Section Points	8	0

Local Government Innovation Fund Project Scoring Sheet

Section 3: Success Measures

Success Measures	Description	Criteria	Points	Applicant Self Score	Validated Score
Expected Return	*Applicant demonstrates as a percentage of savings (i.e., actual savings, increased revenue, or cost avoidance) an expected return. The return must be derived from the applicant's cost basis. The expected return is ranked in one of the following percentage categories:*	75% or greater	**30**	◉	
		25.01% to 74.99%	**20**	○	
		Less than 25%	**10**	○	
			Points	30	0
Past Success	*Applicant has successfully implemented, or is following project guidance from a shared services model, for an efficiency, shared service, coproduction or merger project in the past.*	Yes	**5**	◉	
		No	**0**	○	
			Points	5	0
Scalable/Replicable Proposal	*Applicant's proposal can be replicated by other local governments or scaled for the inclusion of other local governments.*	The project is both scalable and replicable	**10**	◉	
		The project is either scalable or replicable	**5**	○	
		Does not apply	**0**	○	
			Points	10	0
Probability of Success	*Applicant provides a documented need for the project and clearly outlines the likelihood of the need being met.*	Provided	**5**	◉	
		Not Provided	**0**	○	
			Points	5	0
			Total Section Points	50	0

Section 4: Significance Measures

Significance Measures	Description	Criteria	Points Assigned	Applicant Self Score	Validated Score
Performance Audit Implementation /Cost Benchmarking	*The project implements a single recommendation from a performance audit provided by the Auditor of State under Chapter 117 of the Ohio Revised Code or is informed by cost benchmarking.*	Project implements a recommendation from an audit or is informed by benchmarking	**5**	◉	
		Project does not implement a recommendation from an audit and is not informed by benchmarking	**0**	○	
			Points	5	0
Economic Impact	*Applicant demonstrates the project will a promote business environment (i.e., demonstrates a business relationship resulting from the project) and will provide for community attraction (i.e., cost avoidance with respect to taxes)*	Applicant clearly demonstrates economic impact	**5**	◉	
		Applicant mentions but does not prove economic impact	**3**	○	
		Applicant does not demonstrate an economic impact	**0**	○	
			Points	5	0
Response to Economic Demand	*The project responds to current substantial changes in economic demand for local or regional government services.*	Yes	**5**	◉	
		No	**0**	○	
			Points	5	0
			Total Section Points	15	0

Section 5: Council Measures			
Council Measures	Description	Criteria	Points Assigned
Council Preference	*Council Ranking for Competitive Rounds*	**The Applicant Does Not Fill Out This Section**; This is for the Local Government Innovation Fund Council only. The points for this sectionis based on the applicant demonstrating innovation or inventiveness with the project	
		Total Section Points (10 max)	

Scoring Summary

	Applicant Self Score	Validated Score
Section 1: Financing Measures	8	0
Section 2: Collaborative Measures	8	0
Section 3: Success Measures	50	0
Section 4: Significance Measures	15	0
Total Base Points:	81	0

Reviewer Comments

Issue #4: Resolution of Support

Please refer to the following two (2) pages.

DPS 022812 LGIF APPLICATION RESOLUTION
Department of Public Service
Ed Moore (x1835)
(Revised)

RES. 91-12

Resolution authorizing and expressing Toledo City Council support for the Department of Public Service submitting application materials to the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program for the purpose of obtaining financial assistance for the creation of a Regional Composting Facility; and declaring an emergency.

SUMMARY & BACKGROUND:

The State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program administers and has available a competitive grant to financially assist municipalities. The City of Toledo is submitting a Local Government Innovation Fund grant application requesting an amount not to exceed $100,000 for completing a feasibility study for a composting facility. Such a facility would help in protecting, conserving, and enhancing environmental resources and yield savings to the City of Toledo through reduced operating costs while providing healthy work and living environments.

This resolution permits the Department of Public Service to prepare and submit application materials for funding to assist in that process. NOW, THEREFORE,

Be it resolved by the Council of the City of Toledo:

SECTION 1. That the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program administers and has available a competitive grant to financially assist municipalities and that the City of Toledo, Department of Public Service desires to obtain financial assistance from said program.

SECTION 2. That the Mayor of the City of Toledo is authorized to prepare and file application materials to the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program for financial assistance and to provide all information and documentation required to become eligible to access such possible funding assistance.

SECTION 3. That if the city is awarded funding, and subject to availability, appropriation and authorizations, the City of Toledo agrees to obligate the funds required to satisfactorily complete the proposed project; which funding will become eligible for reimbursement under the terms and conditions of the State of Ohio Department of Development, Local Government Innovation Fund Program.

SECTION 4. That this Resolution is declared to be an emergency measure and shall be in force and effect immediately from and after its passage. The reason for the

emergency lies in the fact that the same is necessary for the immediate preservation of the public peace, health, safety, and property and for the further reason that this Resolution must be immediately effective in order to permit the timely submittal of the aforementioned application materials for funding for this important project as soon as possible.

Vote on emergency clause: yeas 12, nays 0.

Adopted: FEB 28 2012, as an emergency measure: yeas 12, nays 0.

Attest: _____
Clerk of Council

_____
President of Council

Approved: MAR -2 2012

_____
Mayor

I hereby certify that the above is a true and correct copy of a Resolution adopted by Council FEB 28 2012.

Attest: _____
Clerk of Council