

**OHIO TAX CREDIT AUTHORITY MEETING  
MEETING MINUTES  
MEETING DATE: MARCH 30, 2015**

The regular meeting of the Ohio Job Creation Tax Credit Authority was called to order at 10:05 a.m. on March 30, 2015 in Columbus, Ohio by David Goodman.

Roll Call:	David Goodman, Chair	Present
	David Smith	Present
	Emmett Kelly	Present
	Rod Crider	Present
	Brian Cooper	Absent

**Staff Members Present:** John Werkman, Daniel Strasser, Stephanie Gostomski, Eric Lindner, and Lisa Colbert

**Others present:** Matt Deptola, Brandon Simmons, Chris Strayer, Arch Dhir, Dustin Lester, Tammy Riddle, John Recker, Lisa Wagner, Stephanie Mercado, Walt Good

**Minutes Approval:** Goodman made a motion to approve the minutes of the February 23, 2015 meeting. Smith seconded. The vote was 3-0 yes. Voting Goodman, Smith, and Crider.

**PROJECTS**

**R & L Carriers, Inc.; R & L Carriers Payroll, LLC; R & L Carriers Shared Services, L.L.C.; and Strategic Management of Florida, LLC** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in Liberty Township, Clinton County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 60% for 9 years for R & L Carriers, Inc.; R & L Carriers Payroll, LLC; R & L Carriers Shared Services, L.L.C.; and Strategic Management of Florida, LLC in exchange for a commitment to create 200 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$9,500,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$70,666,305 in existing payroll at the project location in Liberty Township, Clinton County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2023. Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Hirschvogel Incorporated** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Columbus, Franklin County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 45% for 6 years for Hirschvogel Incorporated in exchange for a commitment to create 37 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$1,300,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$14,358,265 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Columbus, Franklin County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2020. Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**PACS Switchgear, LLC** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Mount Vernon, Knox County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 40% for 7 years for PACS Switchgear, LLC in exchange for a commitment to create 30 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$936,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$1,310,683 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Mount Vernon, Knox County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2016 and end on 12/31/2022. Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Advanced Ground Systems Engineering, LLC** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project at a to-be-determined project location. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 45% for 5 years for Advanced Ground Systems Engineering, LLC in exchange for a commitment to create 15 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$2,270,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$208,235 in existing payroll at the to-be-determined location project. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2019. Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All

present voted yes.

**The C.M. Paula Company** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Mason, Warren County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 40% for 6 years for The C.M. Paula Company in exchange for a commitment to create 29 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$1,580,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$5,657,641 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Mason, Warren County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2020. Crider seconded; Kelly abstained. The vote was 3-0. All present voted yes.

**Masters Pharmaceutical, Inc.; RXTPL LLC; MHC Medical Products, LLC; MHC Pharma, LLC; Delta Hi-Tech, Inc.; and 360 Pharma Group, LLC** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the Cities of Mason and Fairfield, Warren and Butler Counties. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 55% for 7 years for Masters Pharmaceutical, Inc.; RXTPL LLC; MHC Medical Products, LLC; MHC Pharma, LLC; Delta Hi-Tech, Inc.; and 360 Pharma Group, LLC in exchange for a commitment to create 100 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$5,200,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$10,748,240 in existing payroll at the project location in the Cities of Mason and Fairfield, Warren and Butler Counties. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2017 and end on 12/31/2023. Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Nitto Denko AVECIA Inc.** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Reading, Hamilton County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 40% for 5 years for Nitto Denko AVECIA Inc. in exchange for a commitment to create 15 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$1,100,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$4,500,000 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Reading, Hamilton County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2019. Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Tramec Sloan, L.L.C.** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the Cities of Galion and Bucyrus, Crawford County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 50% for 6 years for Tramec Sloan, L.L.C. in exchange for a commitment to create 90 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$2,106,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$4,226,250 in existing payroll at the project location in the Cities of Galion and Bucyrus, Crawford County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2016 and end on 12/31/2021. Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Valfilm, LLC** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Findlay, Hancock County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 55% for 8 years for Valfilm, LLC in exchange for a commitment to create 80 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$2,500,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$3,500,000 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Findlay, Hancock County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2016 and end on 12/31/2023. Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Tiffin Metal Products Co.** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Tiffin, Seneca County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 35% for 5 years for Tiffin Metal Products Co. in exchange for a commitment to create 18 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$684,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$4,778,336 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Tiffin, Seneca County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2019. Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Polymer Additives, Inc.** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in the City of Independence, Cuyahoga County; the City of Cleveland, Cuyahoga County; and the Village of Walton Hills, Cuyahoga County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 40% for 6 years for Polymer Additives, Inc. in exchange for a commitment to create 23 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$2,300,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$9,963,813 in existing payroll at the project location in the City of Independence, Cuyahoga County; the City of Cleveland, Cuyahoga County; and the Village of Walton Hills, Cuyahoga County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2016 and end on 12/31/2021. Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**The Lubrizol Corporation** appeared before the Tax Credit Authority requesting a tax credit for a project in Painesville Township, Lake County. Goodman made a motion to approve a tax credit of 45% for 7 years for The Lubrizol Corporation in exchange for a commitment to create 24 new full-time equivalent employees generating \$1,577,000 in new annual payroll and retaining \$23,602,980 in existing payroll at the project location in Painesville Township, Lake County. In addition, the company will claim the tax credit on income tax revenue generated at the project location in excess of the company's baseline income tax revenue at the project location. The tax credit would begin on 1/1/2015 and end on 12/31/2021. Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

## **OTHER BUSINESS**

### **Mayflower Vehicle Systems, LLC (City of Norwalk/Huron County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority terminate the tax credit agreement without clawback for failure to maintain operations during the post-term reporting period. On 2/27/1995, the grantee was approved for a 60%/10 year tax credit in exchange for a commitment to create 99 new jobs and retain 139 jobs at the project location. In 2014, DSA learned that the grantee closed operations at the project location in 2010, making the grantee noncompliant with the terms of the agreement. Based on additional feedback regarding this project, the staff recommends terminating the agreement without clawback.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

### **Ventaire, LLC (City of Logan/Hocking County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority terminate the tax credit agreement without clawback for failure to maintain operations during the post-term reporting period. On 8/25/2008, the grantee was approved for a 40%/5 year tax credit in exchange for a commitment to create 50 new jobs at the project location. In 2015, DSA learned that the grantee closed operations at the project during the post-term reporting period, making the grantee noncompliant with the terms of the agreement. Because the certificate issued to the grantee was minimal, the staff recommends terminating the agreement without clawback.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

### **Koch Foods of Cincinnati LLC City of Mason/Butler County**

The staff recommends that the Authority make the following changes:

- (1) Reduce the created job commitment from 390 to 364 FTEs;
- (2) Reduce the associated created payroll commitment from \$10,000,000 to \$9,426,144;
- (3) Increase the capital investment commitment from \$42,725,000 to \$71,525,000 (\$41,600,000 in building, \$29,600,000 in machinery/equipment, and \$325,000 in land).

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

### **FirstGroup America, Inc. (City of Cincinnati/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority reduce the retained job commitment from 337 to 330 FTEs.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Global Cloud, Ltd. (City of Cincinnati/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the baseline payroll from \$1,905,464 to \$1,644,807. The new baseline payroll commitment will align with the changes approved at the September 2014 TCA meeting.

Kelly made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Goodman seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Axiom Product Development LLC (City of Blue Ash/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 10979 Reed Hartman Hwy Ste. 304, Blue Ash, OH 45242 to 4370 Creek Rd., Cincinnati, Ohio 45241.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Fusion Technologies- East, LLC (City of Blue Ash/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 4555 Lake Forest Drive, Cincinnati, OH 45242 to 4445 Lake Forest Drive, Suite 440, Cincinnati, Ohio 45242.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Geneva-Liberty Steel, Ltd. (City of Youngstown/ Mahoning County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 1053 Ohio Works Industrial Drive, Youngstown, OH 44510 to 947 Martin Luther King Jr., Blvd., Youngstown, OH 44501.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Global Cooling, Inc. (City of Athens/Athens County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 1065 East St., Athens, OH 45701 to 6000 Poston Rd., Athens, OH 45701.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Integrity Express Logistics LLC (City of Cincinnati/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 8980 Blue Ash Rd., Cincinnati, OH 45242 to 4370 Malsbary Rd., Ste. 200, Cincinnati, OH 45242.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**ThyssenKrupp Bilstein of America, Inc. (City of Hamilton/Butler County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 8685 Berk Blvd., Hamilton, OH 45015 to 8685 Bilstein Blvd., Hamilton, OH 45015. The City of Hamilton changed the name of the road.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**AutoTool, Inc. (Jerome Township/Union County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 8150 Business Way, Plain City, OH 43064 to 7875 Corporate Blvd., Plain City, OH 43064.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**FirstGroup America, Inc. (City of Cincinnati/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 705 Central Avenue, Suite 500, Cincinnati, OH 45202 to 600 Vine Street, Cincinnati, OH 45202-2400.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**E Retailing Associates, LLC (City of Columbus/Franklin County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 1590 West Mound St., Columbus, OH 43223 to 2282 Westbrooke Dr., Columbus, OH 43228.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Mission Essential Personnel, LLC (City of Columbus/Franklin County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the project location from 4343 Easton Commons, Suite 100, Columbus, OH 43219 to 6525 West Campus Oval, Ste. 101, New Albany, Ohio 43054.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Quadax, Inc. (City of Middleburg Heights/Cuyahoga County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority add two additional project locations to the tax credit agreement: 7251 Engle Road, Middleburg Hts., Ohio 44130 and 14843 W. Sprague Rd., Strongsville, Ohio 44136. The grantee has outgrown capacity at the original building. Both new locations are less than 3 miles from the original location.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**VXI Global Solutions, LLC (City of Forrest Park/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority reduce the capital investment commitment from \$3,900,000 to \$400,000.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Matalco (U.S.), Inc. (Village of Lordstown/Trumbull County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the tax credit effective date from 1/1/2014 to 1/1/2015.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**The BON-TON Department Stores, Inc. (Village of Obetz/Madison County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority change the tax credit effective date from 1/1/2014 to 1/1/2015. The baseline income tax revenue will change for year 1 to \$24,968 and for year 2 to \$25,517.79.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded; Kelly abstained. The vote was 3-0. All present voted yes.

**Cole Taylor Bank (City of Wilmington/Clinton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority make the following changes:

- (1) Reassign the tax credit from Cole Taylor Bank (and associated FEIN) to MB Financial Bank, N.A.(and associated FEIN);
- (2) Change the tax credit effective date from 1/1/2013 to 1/1/2014;
- (3) Change the baseline income tax revenue for Year 1 to \$40,012 and for year 2 to \$40,892.

Cole Taylor Bank merged with MB Financial Bank, N.A. The change in tax credit effective date is due to the transition in payroll associated with the merger.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Pepsi-Cola General Bottlers of Ohio, Inc. (City of Toledo/Lucas County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority reassign the tax credit from Pepsi-Cola General Bottlers of Ohio, Inc. (and associated FEIN) to Pepsi-Cola Metropolitan Bottling Company, Inc. (and associated FEIN).

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Scott Process Systems, Inc. (City of Hartville/Stark County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority reassign the tax credit from Scott Process Systems, Inc. (and associated FEIN) to Industrial Piping Inc. (and associated FEIN).

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Pennex Aluminum Company, LLC (Village of Leetonia/Columbiana County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority clarify the name of the grantee on the tax credit agreement for Pennex Aluminum Company, LLC to Lefton Metal Enterprises Corporation dba Pennex Aluminum Company, LLC.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Avnet, Inc. (City of Groveport/Franklin Count)**

The staff recommends that the Authority remove the approved affiliates from the tax credit agreement. All employees will be reported under Avnet, Inc., as the legal entity merger is now complete. Additionally, the staff recommends that the Authority update the previously TBD project location to 5300 Centerpoint Parkway, Groveport, OH 43125.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Ascena Retail Group, Inc. (Etna Township/Licking County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority add the following grantees to the tax credit agreement:

- (1) Lane Bryant, Inc. (and associated FEIN);
- (2) Lane Bryant Purchasing Corp. (and associated FEIN);
- (3) Tween Brands, Inc. (and associated FEIN);
- (4) Tween Brands Direct, LLC (and associated FEIN);
- (5) Tween Brands Purchasing, Inc. (and associated FEIN);
- (6) Tween Brands Store Planning, Inc. (and associated FEIN);
- (7) Tween Brands Agency, Inc. (and associated FEIN);
- (8) Etna Retail DC, LLC (and associated FEIN).

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Ohio National Financial Services, Inc. (City of Montgomery/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority add the grantee, The Ohio National Life Insurance Company (and associated FEIN), to the tax credit agreement.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Smith seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**G-TEKT North America Corporation (TBD/TBD)**

The staff recommends that the Authority update the previously TBD project location to 325 Cramer Creek Ct., Dublin, OH 43017.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**American Engineering & Manufacturing, Inc. (City of Lorain/Lorain County)**

Per the company's request, the staff recommends that the Authority terminate the tax credit agreement. The company has not claimed any tax credit certificates under the program and has agreed to waive any pending or unissued tax credit certificates.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Mettler-Toledo, Inc. (City of Worthington/Franklin County)**

Per the company's request, the staff recommends that the Authority terminate the tax credit agreement. The company has not claimed any tax credit certificates under the program and has agreed to waive any pending or unissued tax credit certificates.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Crider seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Fine Line Graphics Corp. (City of Columbus/Franklin County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority cancel the tax credit. The company never executed the tax credit agreement and has not received any tax credit certificates.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Janova LLC (City of New Albany/Franklin County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority cancel the tax credit. The company never executed the tax credit agreement and has not received any tax credit certificates.

Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**Student Loan Strategies, LLC (Symmes Township/Hamilton County)**

The staff recommends that the Authority cancel the tax credit. The company never executed the tax credit agreement and has not received any tax credit certificates.


Goodman made a motion to accept staff recommendation and Kelly seconded. The vote was 4-0. All present voted yes.

**MOTION TO AJOURN**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:23 pm by David Goodman.

The next meeting is scheduled April 27, 2015 at 10:00 a.m. on the 31<sup>st</sup> Floor.

Chair of Ohio Tax Credit Authority's Signature

  
\_\_\_\_\_