

THE CLEAN OHIO COUNCIL
77 SOUTH HIGH STREET
P.O. BOX 1001
COLUMBUS, OHIO 43216-1001
(614) 995-2292

http://development.ohio.gov/ud/CORFRound5_6.htm

**CLEAN OHIO REVITALIZATION FUND
ROUND 5 AND 6 APPLICATION
Guidance for Part B
Redevelopment Ready Track**

June 2008



Clean **Ohio** Fund

Guidance to Answering Part B Scoring Questions for the Redevelopment Ready Track

General Instructions

- A. The purpose of Part B is to provide a self-contained stand alone section for scoring purposes.
- B. The District Integrating Committee (or Executive Committee, as applicable) may or may not prioritize projects in base score order. A Project scoring the highest base score does not have to be prioritized number one by the District.
- C. Scoring is based on Part B of the application as submitted to the Ohio Public Works District Integrating Committee. No additional information may be included in the application for Part B after the application is placed on file at the library.
- D. The scoring in Part B and the eligibility requirements in Part A are **separate and unconnected**. A Project may have a high base score and be ineligible for funding consideration; a Project may have a low score and be funded, if eligible.
- E. Points will not be given if the required documentation is not provided.
- F. An applicant may choose to provide no documentation and thus receive no points for a measure or part thereof.
- G. Part B of the application can be downloaded and completed in Microsoft Excel™. This version will calculate all formulas for you as you enter information. A copy of the self-scored application and attachments must be provided in a three ring binder.
- H. Decimal answers and percentages are used for some measures. Note: a percentage answer is the decimal answer multiplied by 100.

Economic Benefit

Question 1. Infrastructure Usage

This scoring measure encourages redevelopment in older communities. The property must currently be serviced by water and sewer lines. Applicant will score “0” if the property is not serviced by water and sewer lines. Accepted types of infrastructure include roads, storm sewers, energy utilities, and/or adjacent commuter/passenger rail. Serviced by infrastructure is defined as on or directly adjacent to the project property. To document this scoring measure, map to scale indicating the location of infrastructure in relation to the project property must be included in Attachment B1.

Ten (10) Points

Ten points are awarded to project properties which are serviced by the four types of infrastructure listed above.

Five (5) Points

Five points are awarded to project properties which are serviced by three of the four types of infrastructure listed above.

One (1) point

One point is awarded to project properties which are serviced by two of the four types of infrastructure listed above.

Question 2. Vacant Property

Points are scored if 100% of property is vacant at the time of the application.

Question 3. Acquisition

Only projects where the applicant, the non-profit organization or the development partner owns the entire property at the time of application are eligible for these points. This means that no further legal or financial transactions will be required to acquire the property prior to conducting cleanup activities.

Note: The property owner must not have caused or contributed to the contamination on the property.

To document this scoring measure, a copy of the Deed to the project property must be included in Part A Attachment A5.

Question 4. Location

Points are awarded for project properties that are easily accessible for potential end users. Scoring is based on the relative distance to a source of commerce including: commercial rail line, navigable waterway, and/or major roadway. Major roadway is defined as a U.S. Route, Interstate or Ohio State Route.

To document this scoring measure, a map, to scale, documenting the separation distance from sources of commerce must be included in **Attachment B2.**

Five (5) Points

Five points are awarded to project properties that are located within 0.5 miles of two of the sources of commerce listed above.

One (1) point

One point is awarded to project properties that are located within 0.5 miles of one of the sources of commerce listed above.

Question 5. Unrestricted Use

Points are awarded for marketability. Project properties with no use restrictions (cleaned to unrestricted point of compliance) have more development options. The scoring measure is documented in Part A Attachment A17 (Remedial Action Plan).

Unrestricted use is defined as meeting applicable standards up to a 10 feet point of compliance for soil without any engineering controls or use restrictions and no anticipated indoor air pathways.

Environmental Improvement

Question 6. Remedy Selection

Three (3) Points

Three points are awarded to an application only if an **active** remedy is proposed for **all** environmental media that are impacted above applicable standards on the **entire** property.

Active remedies may include, but are not limited to:

- Soil excavation and removal;
- Soil and/or ground water chemical or biological treatment;
- Reactive barrier walls;
- Ground water pump-and-treat systems; or
- Any other method or technology that either removes the contaminant or renders it to a level that meets applicable standards.

No points will be awarded in a situation when a contaminant that exceeds an applicable standard remains in place on any portion of the property by any of the following non-active remedial measures:

- The placement of cover material or the use of existing material that acts as a barrier or provides a separation between the contaminant and the applicable point of compliance;
- The construction of a cap that acts as a cover and/or prevents water infiltration and leaching of a contaminant into the ground water;
- Any other containment system that is designed to break or minimize the exposure pathway between a contaminant and a receptor;
- The reliance of an Urban Setting Designation (USD) to address off-property migration of contaminated ground water.

No points will be awarded if a proposed remedy is a combination of an active remedy and a non-active remedy.

No points will be awarded if asbestos is the only contaminant of concern and all other environmental media already meet applicable standards.

Part A Attachment A17 and/or A18 should be used to support whether an active remedy is proposed for the site or whether any covers, caps, containment systems, or USD's will be relied upon to meet applicable standards.

Question 7. Proximity to Receptors - Home, School, Daycare

The home, school and daycare receptors shall include: residences; daycare facilities; schools, colleges and other educational institutions; nursing homes, elder care and other long-term health care facilities; and, correctional facilities. All distances to these receptors should be measured in feet from the closest identified receptor to the nearest property boundary of the project. Points are awarded if **one** of these receptors is present within 1500 feet of the property. Points are not cumulative if multiple receptors are present.

In order to receive points for this question, **all** of the following documentation must be provided in **Attachment B3**:

1. The type/name of the receptor, the distance (in feet) from the project property boundary and the address of the receptor;
2. Map, to scale, documenting the separation distance; and
3. At least one recent aerial photograph, noting the project property boundaries and the location of the receptor.

Question 8. Proximity to Receptors - Source Water Assessment and Protection (SWAP) Area

Three (3) Points

Three points are awarded if the project property, or any portion thereof, lies directly within the SWAP five-year time of travel of potential contamination of any susceptibility (i.e., low, medium or high). Ohio EPA will be using the documentation that you provide in Part A Attachment (Property Description) to score this question.

SWAP area boundaries are defined on maps available through the Ohio EPA, Division of Drinking and Ground Waters. If you would like to verify if any portion of your property lies within the SWAP five-year time of travel, please contact Julie Gillenwater, Ohio EPA, DERR /SABR, at (614) 644-3748 or e-mail at julie.gillenwater@epa.state.oh.us

Question 9 Exposure Potential

This measure intends to differentiate projects based on the degree of contamination present on the property. Higher concentrations of contaminants will equate to a higher score. The maximum score for this measure is eight points. The points for this measure are not cumulative. Only the maximum score from one of the scoring choices will be awarded.

The highest soil or ground water contaminant concentrations determined during the Phase II assessment of the project property should be compared to Voluntary Action Program (VAP) generic residential standards found in the newly proposed Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3745-300-08(B)(3)(b) Table II, (f) Table V, and generic unrestricted potable use standards for ground water found in the newly proposed OAC 3745-300-08(C)(3)(b) Table VI and (c) Table VII. (See: www.epa.state.oh.us/derr/vap/rules/vaprules.html) In addition, the following supplemental residential direct contact and unrestricted potable use value tables developed by the VAP may also be used if a contaminant is not listed in the proposed VAP rules:

**Supplemental Residential Direct Contact Soil Values
Voluntary Action Program Technical Assistance**

**DIRECT CONTACT SOILS: RESIDENTIAL LAND USE CATEGORY
(VALUES ARE IN MG/KG).**

CHEMICAL OF CONCERN	RESIDENTIAL SINGLE CHEMICAL DIRECT CONTACT SOIL VALUE (mg/kg)
2-methylnaphthalene	7800
4-chlorotoluene	230
Acenaphthylene	4700
Benzo(g,h,i)perylene	1700
Copper	2700
Dimethyl phthalate	2800
Methyl butyl ketone	6300
n-butyl benzene	250
n-propyl benzene	110
Phenanthrene	24000
p-isopropyltoluene	110
sec-butyl benzene	530
tert-butyl benzene	390

Updated: January, 2008

**Calculated TPH Soil Values Using VAP's Risk Assessment
Spreadsheets**

TPH Range / Fraction	Direct Contact Soil Values (mg/kg)	
	Residential Land Use	
	Child	Adult
TPH-G C6-C12	780	
TPH-D C10-C20	960	
TPH-O C20-C35	1,700	
>C6-C8 Aliphatics	11,000	
>C8-C10 Aliphatics	1,100	
>C10-C12 Aliphatics	2,200	
>C12-C16 Aliphatics	5,600	
>C16-C(21 or 35) Aliphatics	110,000	
>C8-C10 Aromatics	590	
>C10-C12 Aromatics	1,100	
>C12-C16 Aromatics	1,800	
>C16-C21 Aromatics	2,300	
>C21-C35 Aromatics	1,700	

Supplemental Unrestricted Potable Use Values
Voluntary Action Program Technical Assistance

(VALUES ARE IN UG/L OR MICROGRAMS PER LITER).

CHEMICAL OF CONCERN	SINGLE CHEMICAL Unrestricted Potable Use Values (ug/l)
Acenaphthylene	670
Acrylonitrile	2.8
Benzidine	0.0069
Benzo(a)anthracene	0.26
Benzo(b)fluoranthene	0.17
Benzo(k)fluoranthene	1.7
Benzo(g,h,i)perylene	63
n-butyl benzene	1,900
sec-butyl benzene	1,700
tert-butyl benzene	2200
4-chlorotoluene	280
Dibenz(a,h)anthracene	0.021
Dichlorobenzidine, 3,3	3.3
Dimethyl phthalate	13,000
1,3-Dinitrobenzene, meta	1.6
Dinitrobenzene, ortho	6.3
Hexachloro-1,3-Butadiene	2.7
Indeno(1,2,3-cd)-pyrene	0.22
p-isopropyltoluene (Cymene)	23,000
Methyl butyl ketone	800
2-methylnaphthalene	2,400
Perchlorate	11.0
Nitrobenzene	7.5
Phenanthrene	2,800
n-propyl benzene	1,300
Trichloropropane, 1,2,3	0.22

Updated: January, 2008

The VAP generic standards and supplemental values provide a list of the most common compounds identified at brownfield properties. Only compounds found in the VAP rules or the above supplemental value tables can be used to develop the score for this measure. When determining a score for this measure, each contaminant shall be compared to each published generic standard or supplemental value and a multiple chemical adjustment shall NOT be performed if more than one contaminant is present.

The score is determined as follows:

For soil:

$$\text{Soil concentration (mg/kg)} \div \text{by the generic residential standard or supplemental soil value (mg/kg)} = X$$

OR

For ground water:

Ground water concentration (ug/l) ÷ by the unrestricted potable use standard or supplemental ground water value (ug/l) = Y

If X or Y is 100 or greater, Score = 8 points

If X or Y is 20 to 99.9, Score = 4 points

If X or Y is 1 to 19.9, Score = 1 point

To achieve maximum points in this scoring measure, at least one contaminant (soil or ground water) must be present on the property that is at least 100 times the VAP generic standards or supplemental values.

No points will be awarded if all soil or ground water concentrations are below VAP generic standards or supplemental values, or if soil or ground water media have not been impacted. (e.g. If Regulated Asbestos Containing Material is the only contaminant of concern, Score = 0.)

Example:

The highest lead concentration found in soil was 45,000 mg/kg. The highest benzene concentration in ground water was 420 ug/l. The residential soil standard for lead is 400 mg/kg. Divide the concentration in soil by the generic standard: (45,000/400 = 112.5). The unrestricted potable use standard for benzene is 5 ug/l. Divide the groundwater concentration by the generic standard: (420/5 = 84.0). Lead is greater than 100 times the generic residential standard and is worth 8 points, while benzene is only 20 times the generic standard and worth 4 points. Therefore, a score of 8 points would be designated for this question since the lead concentration, not benzene, produced the maximum score.

To document this scoring measure, a map must be included in **Attachment B4** that shows identified areas, sample location, and sampling data, which support whether a soil or ground water concentration exceeds generic residential standards, unrestricted potable use standards, or supplemental values.

Question 10. Orphan Property or Responsible Party Contribution

Points can only be awarded in either the Orphan Property category or the Responsible Party Contribution category, but **not both**.

Orphan Property

Seven (7) Points

Seven points are awarded if no viable responsible parties exist.

One (1) Point

One point is awarded if the property is an orphan property only because of the CERCLA building materials exemption (e.g., asbestos). No points are awarded if the property fails to meet the definition of an orphan property.

An orphan property means any property for which no viable responsible party that caused or contributed to the contamination at the property exists to contribute funds for the cleanup of the property. Responsible parties should be identified by conducting a Potentially Responsible Party (PRP) Search following U.S. EPA guidelines (OSWER Directive 9834.3-2a, PRP Search Supplemental Guidance for Sites in the Superfund Remedial Program, Final, June 16, 1989). At a minimum, this search must identify present and past OWNERS and OPERATORS that caused or contributed to the contamination at the property through a title search for the property, using typical "Phase I" information,

and appropriate interviews of past owners and operators, employees, and local residents. A property can be considered an orphan property if the business entities who acted as owners or operators and caused or contributed to the contamination at the property are either liquidated or no longer in existence. A search for transporters associated with past ownership or operations is not required, **unless** the property has been used as a dump or solid waste landfill.

PRP viability should be determined using readily available financial research tools such as Dun & Bradstreet or Standard & Poor. The PRP search and viability determination should be documented in **Attachment B5**.

The applicant is not obligated to take the time and effort to complete this search and, therefore, zero points will be assigned for this measure.

Responsible Party Contribution

If viable responsible parties are identified, up to seven points will be awarded based on the percentage of environmental cleanup costs that are committed by the responsible parties; **or** seven points will be awarded if environmental remediation at the property is required by solid or hazardous waste closure obligation, decision document or court order, and the viable responsible parties exist and will contribute 100% of the environmental cleanup costs. Only actual dollar contributions from viable responsible parties can be included in this measure. Any contributions by non-responsible parties (e.g., applicant, development partner, etc.) **cannot** be applied as a contribution. Furthermore, the reduction in property sale price by a responsible party owner is **not** applicable to this measure.

Environmental cleanup costs means those costs to contain, remove or dispose of hazardous substances or petroleum at the brownfield and does **not** include acquisition, demolition, or infrastructure costs.

The percentage of responsible party contribution must be calculated by dividing the total dollars committed by all responsible parties divided by the total environmental cleanup costs (excluding any acquisition, demolition or infrastructure costs):

Total PRP contributions ÷ total environmental cleanup cost x 100 = ___ %

A summary of the responsible party contributions and environmental cleanup costs should be provided in **Attachment B5**.

Question 11. Green Building

Two (2) Points

Two points are awarded if the applicant or local government entity has passed a Resolution or Ordinance that ensures any renovation or new building construction follows Leadership in Energy & Environmental Design (LEED) standards. LEED standards can be found on the U.S. Green Building Council's web page located at: www.usgbc.org/leed/

CORF projects are not required to seek LEED certification, however certified projects receive a LEED plaque, which is the nationally recognized symbol demonstrating that a building is environmentally responsible, profitable and a healthy place to live and work. Following LEED standards promotes a whole-building approach to sustainability by recognizing performance in five key areas of human and environmental health: sustainable site development, water savings, energy efficiency, materials selection and indoor environmental quality.

An example of an acceptable resolution can be found in Appendix 1.

If you have questions about Green Buildings or LEED standards, please contact Julie Gillenwater, Ohio EPA, DERR/SABR, at (614) 644-3748 or e-mail at julie.gillenwater@epa.state.oh.us

To document this scoring measure, a copy of the executed Resolution or Ordinance should be included **Attachment B6**.

Question 12. Total Acreage

Three (3) Points

Up to three points will be awarded based on total project acreage above 0.5.

No points will be awarded to project properties that are smaller than 0.5 acres.

Total acreage should be documented in Part A Attachment A4.

Match

Match includes cash, in-kind services, or portions of grants specifically expended on project property for eligible activities. Match can either have been expended within two years prior to the application submittal to the Integrating Committee (October 2006 – October 2008) or pledged to be expended during the application process and 30 month grant period (October 2008 – August 2011). Eligible match categories are clearance, assessment, environmental insurance, acquisition, demolition, cleanup and infrastructure. The infrastructure must be on or adjacent to the project property. Application preparation is not an eligible match item.

Question 13. Percentage Participation

Percentage of total match contribution to the CORF project. Up to two points will be awarded based on the match percentage of the total project costs. While 25% match is required for the program, additional points are given if the match is larger than that amount.

This scoring will be documented in Attachment A8 of Part A (Sources and Uses of Funds).

Funds received through the Clean Ohio Assistance Fund program may NOT be counted as match.

Question 14. Private Match Contribution

Amount or percentage participation of match dollars provided through private capital for eligible activities. Up to three points will be awarded based on the private match percentage of the total project costs.

This scoring will be documented in Part A Attachment A8 (Sources and Uses of Funds).

Loan(s) from a public loan program borrowed by the private entity are included as Private Match Contribution.

Benefit to Low Income

To find the census tract(s) for the property go to the website
http://factfinder.census.gov/servlet/SAFFacts?_submenuId=factsheet_1&_sse=on .

In the upper right hand corner of the screen you will see a search box. Beneath the search box is a link called “Search by Address” Click this link and then type in the address of the PROJECT PROPERTY in the boxes provided then click “GO”. This will bring up a new page. To the left of the search box you will now see a link for a particular census tract number. Click that link and the new page will show you the census tract, percent poverty and percent minority. Use these values to answer question 15.

Question 15. Location of Property

Points are based on the percentage of poverty in the census tract in which the project property is located.

To document this scoring measure, census tract information must be included in **Attachment B7**.

Project Viability

Question 16. Strategic Plan in Place

A strategic plan is a comprehensive plan that guides the future economic development or land use of the community in which the project property is located. It includes a mission statement, identifies priorities, and outlines short-term, mid-term, and long-term goals. It is a working document that guides decisions that a community will make on issues that affect the entire community. It is used to determine funding priorities.

Five (5) Points

Five points are awarded for a strategic plan adopted by the municipality or township in which the project property is located; that specifically identifies physical plans for the area, including the project property (i.e. renovation, demolition or upgrades to infrastructure); and that has been updated within the past three years. **Note: Submit only the portion of the plan that applies to the project property.**

Three (3) Points

Three points are awarded for a strategic plan adopted by the municipality or township in which the project property is located; that identifies the surrounding area and has been updated within the past three years. **Note: Submit only the portion of the plan that applies to the project property.**

One (1) Point

One point is awarded for a general strategic plan adopted by the municipality or township in which the project property is located.

To document this scoring measure, the applicable portions of the plan must be included in **Attachment B8**.

Question 17. New Jurisdiction

New jurisdiction is defined as a brownfield project located in a jurisdiction that has not applied or received a previous CORF award. If it is unclear whether a project qualifies for this measure contact the Urban Development Division at 614-995-2292 or via email at urban@development.ohio.gov

Question 18. Building Coverage

Up to three points will be awarded based on the percentage of building coverage on the project property. The Redevelopment Ready track encourages blight removal of large onsite structures rather than vacant lots.

Onsite structures are buildings or building foundations and do **NOT** include parking lots.

To calculate the percentage of building coverage:

[Square footage of project property ÷ total square footage of building(s) and/or foundation(s)] X 100

Go to <http://www.convert-me.com/en/convert/area> to convert the property acreage to square feet.

Question 19. Demolition

Points are awarded for the demolition of all onsite structures, including substructures. The Redevelopment Ready track encourages apparent physical revitalization on the property.

This scoring will be documented in Part A Attachment A18 (Project Assumptions and Cost Estimates).

Combination of Uses

Question 20. Inclusion of Green Space

Points are awarded for project properties that incorporate a project funded by the Clean Ohio Green Space Conservation Program and/or Clean Ohio Trails Program on or adjacent to the project property.

To document this scoring measure, proof of the funding must be included in **Attachment B10**.

Loans

Question 21. Loans

Applicant requests a portion of the requested funds in loan form rather than as a grant.

To document this scoring measure, a financial management plan that the applicant will implement to repay the loan must be included in **Attachment B11**.

Bonus Points

Question 22. Collaboration

As a key priority for the Ohio Department of Development, local government collaboration multiplies the regional benefit of projects and is a recognized element of the State's economic well being.

Points are awarded for project properties that are located within a minimum of two municipal corporations and/or townships and each jurisdiction officially supports the project. A demonstrated minimum 5% of total match for the project must be provided by each jurisdiction.

To document this scoring measure, a scale map showing a minimum of 25% of the project property located within each jurisdiction and the adopted Resolution, Ordinance or collaborations agreement must be included in **Attachment B12**, and the match must be included in Part A Attachment A8 (Sources and Uses of Funds).

Question 23. Economic Development Innovation Zones

As a key priority for the Ohio Department of Development, leveraging the development impact of community institutions multiplies the neighborhood benefit of projects and is a recognized element of the state's economic well being.

Points are awarded for project properties located within a one-mile radius of an existing University System of Ohio institution or a private four-year university, public hospital, or non-profit research institution that is not currently owned by the university, hospital, or institution. A demonstrated minimum 5% of total match for the project must be provided from the eligible entity.

To document this scoring measure, a scale map showing the project property within a one-mile radius of an eligible entity and a letter from the institution must be included in **Attachment B13**, and the match must be included in Part A Attachment A8 (Sources and Uses of Funds). The letter from the institution must state a connection between the institution's core assets and the proposed end use.

APPENDIX 1

RESOLUTION NO. []

BY:

In support of a Clean Ohio Revitalization Fund (CORF) project located at [] to have any public and/or private new construction or renovation incorporate materials and methodologies that maximize economic and environmental performance through sustainable design practices.

WHEREAS, this Council believes that high-performance buildings are desirable for [Local government] because they protect, conserve, and enhance environmental resources, yield cost savings to the [Local government] taxpayers through reduced operating costs, and provide healthy work and living environments; and

WHEREAS, the [Local government] desires to merge sound, environmentally responsible practices into one discipline that looks at the environmental, economic, and social effects of a building or built project as a whole.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED by the Council of [Local government] State of Ohio:

Section 1. The [Local government] will require the use of building materials and methods that promote environmental quality, economic vitality, and social benefit through the design, construction and/or renovation at CORF project [name of project] located at [address of property].

Section 2. The [Local government] will require establishment of performance goals for both renovation and new construction projects located at [address of property] and require utilization of Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) standards developed by the US Green Building Council.

Section 3. This resolution shall take effect only if [applicant] is a successful CORF grant recipient.

Adopted [Date], 200 []

Approved this [] day of [], 200 []

[NAME, Title]

Attest:

[NAME]
[Title]